



24/12/2024



OIA: 1337081 – Information about University Advisory Group

Thank you for your email of 30 September 2024 to the Ministry of Education (the Ministry) requesting the following information:

1. *A full overview and breakdown of all costs associated with the University Advisory Group (UAG), including member fees and remuneration, administrative/secretariat costs, hosting, etc.*
2. *All communications (email, text, phone, etc.) between the Ministry and the chair of the UAG Sir Peter Gluckman.*
3. *Any and all communications to or from the Ministry regarding the UAG's initial report.*
4. *A copy of all submissions received by the UAG during phases one and two of consultation.*

On 18 October 2024, you clarified **part two** of your request as follows:

2. *All communications (email, text, phone, etc.) between the Ministry and the chair of the UAG Sir Peter Gluckman - I'm happy for you to exclude incidental/administrative communications such as arranging meeting times and other logistics. I am particularly interested in communications relating to the membership selection process including selection and acceptance of the chair as well as discussion of costs associated with the UAG, but also wish to receive any advice, policy considerations, briefings, notes, opinions, or options under consideration that fall outside of these incidental communications.*

Your request has been considered under the Official Information Act 1982 (the Act).

The Ministry responded to **parts one and four** of your request on 29 October 2024, and advised you of our decision on **parts two and three** of your request on 10 December 2024.

Part three of your request was refused under section 18(a) of the Act, since, by virtue of section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act, there is good reason for withholding the information to maintain the constitutional conventions for the time being which protect the confidentiality of advice tendered by Ministers of the Crown and officials.



Some of the information in scope of **part two** of your request was also refused under section 18(d) of the Act, as the information is or will soon be publicly available.

Please find enclosed as **Appendix A** the remaining documents in scope of **part two** of your request. As advised on 10 December 2024, some information has been withheld under the following sections of the Act:

- 9(2)(a), to protect the privacy of natural persons, including that of deceased natural persons
- 9(2)(b)(ii), to protect information where the making available of the information would be likely to unreasonably prejudice the commercial position of the person who supplied or who is the subject of the information
- 9(2)(f)(iv), to maintain the constitutional conventions for the time being which protect the confidentiality of advice tendered by Ministers of the Crown and officials
- 9(2)(g)(i), to maintain the effective conduct of public affairs through the free and frank expression of opinions by or between or to Ministers of the Crown or members of an organisation or officers and employees of any public service agency or organisation in the course of their duty
- 9(2)(i), to enable a Minister of the Crown or any public service agency or organisation holding the information to carry out, without prejudice or disadvantage, commercial activities.

As required under section 9(1) of the Act, I have considered the public interest in releasing the information withheld. I do not consider that the public interest considerations favouring the release of this information are sufficient to outweigh the need to withhold it at this time.

Please refer to the **Document Table Appendix A** below for a list of all documents in scope of part two of your request, including my decision on release. For clarity and completeness, I have included in the document table the publicly available documents that were refused in our previous response to you. Please note, the total number of documents in the document table below differs from the number communicated in our letter to you of 10 December 2024, due to a counting error.

Please note, we may publish this response on our website after five working days. Your name and contact details will be removed.

Thank you again for your email. You have the right to ask an Ombudsman to review my decision on your request, in accordance with section 28 of the Act. You can do this by writing to info@ombudsman.parliament.nz or to Office of the Ombudsman, PO Box 10152, Wellington 6143.

Nāku noa, nā



James Campbell
Senior Policy Manager, Tertiary Policy
Te Pou Kaupapahere | Policy

Document Table Appendix A

#	Date	From	To	Subject	Decision on release
1	6 March 2024	Donna McKenzie	Catherine Ryan Clara Rowe	FW: UAG names	Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information is publicly available at: https://web-assets.education.govt.nz/s3fs-public/2024-10/1333318-Appendix-A.pdf?VersionId=9T_RBLLxTTPpR9QFmtNgpecK7YtY_QdJ4_ .
2	7 March 2024	Andy Jackson	Katrina Sutich	RE: UAG names	
3	7 March 2024	MEMO: University Advisory Group – approval to begin the appointment process			
4	7 March 2024	MEMO: University Advisory Group – agreement to delegate the management and appointment of the UAG			
5	14 March 2024	MEMO: UAG Membership and Probity Checks			
6	15 March 2024	Andy Jackson	James Campbell	Ministers’ view of panel – confidential	
7	3 April 2024			FW: AUG members – candidates for feedback	
8	4 April 2024			FW: UAG – Weekly Meeting	
9	4 April 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Katrina Sutich; Tim Fowler - TEC	RE: University Review panel	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
10	8 April 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Hema Sridhar; Alastair MacCormick	MoE/TEC feedback on draft UAG questions	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
11	9 April 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman	Conflicts of Interest Register	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.

12	10 April 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman	RE: Conflicts of Interest Register	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
13	10 April 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Alastair MacCormick	Proposed UAG initial briefing material	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
13a	Attachment: Initial UAG Slides.pptx				Released in full.
13b	Attachment: Initial briefing contents.docx				Released in full.
13c	Attachment: 2.3 TEC investment process and framework.docx				Released in full.
13d	Attachment: 3.1 Funding and performance by university.docx				Released in full.
13e	Attachment: 3.2 TEC board paper university finances.docx				Released in part. Information withheld under sections 9(2)(a), (9)(2)(b)(ii), 9(2)(f)(iv), 9(2)(g)(i) and 9(2)(i) of the Act.
13f	Attachment: 4.1 International Education .pdf Education Report: Growing the number of International Students in New Zealand METIS 1319472				Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information is publicly available at: https://web-assets.education.govt.nz/s3fs-public/2024-11/3.%201319472%20ER%20-%20Growing%20the%20number%20of%20international%20students%20in%20New%20Z%20Redacted.pdf?VersionId=G5XnvRhRGDlpiPYZSvG.cViVL2LGYvk .
13g	Attachment: 1.1 TEC BIM.pdf				Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information is publicly available at: https://www.tec.govt.nz/assets/Ministerial-papers/Briefing-for-the-Incoming-Minister-for-Tertiary-Education-and-Skills.pdf .
13h	Attachment: 1.2 ER Tertiary education and skills BIM redacted.pdf				Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information is publicly available at: 14.-1319031-Tertiary-education-and-skills-for-release Redacted.pdf .
13i	Attachment: 1.3 Legislative settings Memo for UAG.docx				Released in full.

13j	Attachment: 2.1 Challenges and opportunities in HE.pdf				Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information is publicly available at: https://assets.education.govt.nz/public/Documents/our-work/information-releases/Advice-Seen-by-our-Ministers/November-2023/1--Challenges-and-opportunities-in-higher-education-funding.pdf .
13k	Attachment: 2.2 Memo for UAG_Research Funding in TE.docx				Released in full.
14	24 May 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman	Engagement plan and planning for 13 June	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
14a	Attachment: UAG all staff briefings summary of issues (002).docx				Released in full.
15	30 May 2024	James Campbell	UAG Members,	Vote Tertiary Budget Overview for UAG	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
15a	Attachment: Vote Tertiary B24 Overview.pdf				Released in full
16	4 June 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; TEC - Deirdre Marshall	RE: UAG meeting this afternoon	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
17	4 June 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman	RE: Academic governance	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
17a	Attachment: FINAL University governance models and international comparison				Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
18	5 June 2024	Peter Gluckman	James Campbell	Re: Academic governance	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
19	7 June 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Alastair MacCormick	Proposed reference material for 13 June	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
19a	Attachment: Draft international university comparison June 2024.docx				Released in full.

19b	Attachment: UAG Briefing – Differentiation in the Aotearoa New Zealand university sector.docx				Released in full.
20	10 June 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Hema Sridhar	RE: Proposed reference material for 13 June	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
20a	Attachment: Draft international university comparison June 2024.docx				Released in full.
20b	Attachment: UAG Briefing – Differentiation in the Aotearoa New Zealand university sector.docx				Released in full.
21	11 June 2024	James Campbell	Hema Sridhar; Peter Gluckman; Emily Strong	RE: Proposed reference material for 13 June	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
21a	Attachment: UAG all staff briefings summary of issues				Released in full.
22	13 June 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Hema Sridhar	FW: Submission to UAG: Research on the effects of New Zealand's PBRF scheme	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
22a	Attachment: The performance-based research fund in New Zealand taking stock and looking forward. New Zealand Economic Papers.pdf				Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information is publicly available at: https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/00779954.2022.2156382 .
22b	Attachment: Sources of PBRF convergence. Scientometrics 2022.pdf				Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information is publicly available at: https://doi.org/10.1007/s11192-022-04376-9 .
22c	Attachment: An evaluation of metrics used the Performancebased Research Fund process in New Zealand – NZ Economic Papers.pdf				Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information is publicly available at: https://www.tandfonline.com/loi/rnzp20 .
22d	Attachment: Fifteen years of a PBRFS in New Zealand. Australian Economic Review.pdf				Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information is publicly available at: https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/1467-8462.12415 .

22e	Attachment: [names withheld under section 9(2)(a)] Submission to UAG 2024.pdf				Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information will soon be publicly available at https://uag.org.nz/
23	18 June 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman	UAG next steps	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
24	21 June 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; UAG Members	UAG minutes and Phase 2 questions	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
24a	Attachment: 240616 UAG Phase 2 Submission Questions.docx				Released in full.
24b	Attachment: 130624 UAG minutes.docx				Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
24c	Attachment: FULL-TES-2020.pdf				Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information is publicly available at: https://www.education.govt.nz/our-work/strategies-policies-and-programmes/tertiary-and-further-education/tertiary-education-strategy-tes .
25	23 June 2024	Peter Gluckman	Hema Sridhar; Richard Walley; James Campbell	Please circulate to SSAG and UAG	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
25a	Attachment: 60_-_rise_value_of_research-june15_1.pdf				Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information is publicly available at: https://ec.europa.eu/futurium/en/system/files/ged/60_-_rise-value_of_research-june15_1.pdf .
26	24 June 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman	RE: Please circulate to SSAG and UAG	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
26a	Attachment: Sources of PBRF convergence. Scientometrics 2022.pdf				See Document 22b.
26b	Attachment: The performance based research fund in New Zealand taking stock and looking forward. New Zealand Economic Papers.pdf				See Document 22a.
26c	Attachment: An evaluation of metrics used the Performancebased Research Fund process in New Zealand – NZ Economic Papers.pdf				See Document 22c.

26d	Attachment: [names withheld under section 9(2)(a)] Submission to UAG 2024.pdf				See Document 22e.
26e	Attachment: Fifteen years of a PBRFS in New Zealand. Australian Economic Review.pdf				See Document 22d.
26f	Attachment: 170 MPI_Phase1_UAG submissions.pdf				Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information will soon be publicly available at https://uag.org.nz/ .
27	24 June 2024	James Campbell	Hema Sridhar; Peter Gluckman	RE: Please circulate to SSAG and UAG	Withhold in full under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
28	26 June 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; UAG members	Summary of Phase 1 submissions	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
28a	Attachment: UAG themes from phase 1 consultation.pdf				Withhold in full under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
29	27 June 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Alastair MacCormick	FW: Letter re changes to academic audit in the university sector	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
29a	Attachment: Letter to external stakeholders on changes to academic audit.pdf				Released in full.
30	1 July 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Hema Sridhar	FW: Summary of Phase 1 submissions	Withhold in full under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
30a	Attachment: UAG themes from phase 1 consultation.pdf				Withhold in full under section 9(2)(f)(iv).
31	1 July 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Hema Sridhar	RE: Summary of Phase 1 submissions	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
32	9 July 2024	Peter Gluckman	UAG members	UAG - outline of report for comment	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
32a	Attachment: UAG draft outline.docx				Withhold in full under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
33	11 July 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; UAG members	Material for UAG consideration	Released in part. Information withheld under sections 9(2)(a) and 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
33a	Attachment: UAG briefing in progress.docx				Released in full.

33b	Attachment: university visits; UAG memo on SSAG recs.docx				Withhold in full under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
34	17 July 2024	Peter Gluckman	James Campbell; Hema Sridhar	UAG next steps	Released in part. Information has been withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
34a	Attachment: 03.07 Student Reference Group Minutes.docx				Released in part. Information withheld under section (9)(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
35	18 July 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Hema Sridhar	RE: UAG items for discussion	Released in part. Information withheld under sections 9(2)(a) of the Act.
35a	Attachment: UAG briefing on university definition.docx				Released in full
36	23 July 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Hema Sridhar	NZQA discussion with the UAG	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
37	23 July 2024	Peter Gluckman	UAG members; Hema Sridhar; Hamish Spencer; Tracey McIntosh	Report outline update	Released in full
37a	Attachment: UAG report 2.docx				Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information will soon be publicly available at https://uag.org.nz/
38	23 July 2024	Peter Gluckman	Beatrice Turner; Hema Sridhar; UAG members; James Campbell	Re: University Advisory Group panel meeting	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
39	24 July 2024	Peter Gluckman	James Campbell	Re: Agenda for next week and university visits	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
40	30 July 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Hema Sridhar; Alastair MacCormick	UAG discussions	Released in part. Information withheld under sections 9(2)(a) and 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
40a	Attachment: International governance comparison table (002).docx				Released in full.

41	2 August 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman	Discussion at 3pm	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
41a	Attachment: UNZ briefings to UAG – cover note v2.docx				Released in full.
41b	Attachment: The Cost of Living and Universities (1).pdf				Released in full.
41c	Attachment: Title withheld in full under section 9(2)(f)(iv)				Withhold in full under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
42	2 August 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Hema Sridhar;	FW: Letter from Universities New Zealand - regulatory burden in the university sector	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
42a	Attachment: Letter Minister Simmonds Regulatory Burden in the University Sector July 2024.pdf				Released in full.
43	2 August 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; UAG members	UAG progress update	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
43a	Attachment: UAG Briefing Note Future of online vs campus-based learning V3.docx				Released in full.
43b	Attachment: UAG Briefing Note What are the key issues and potential solutions regarding the academic workforce V3. docx				Released in full.
43c	Attachment: UAG Briefing Note Have universities become overly centralised and managerial V4.docx				Released in full.
43d	Attachment: UAG Briefing Note PBRF V6.docx				Released in full.
	Attachment: UNZ briefings to UAG – cover note v2.docx				See document 46a.
43e	Attachment: Indicative UAG activities July August 2024.docx				Released in full.
	Attachment: The Cost of Living and Universities (1).pdf				See document 46b.
44	5 August 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman	RE: University crisis looms as teenagers say no to degrees	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.

45	6 August 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; UAG members	RE: UAG progress update	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
45a	Attachment: UAG briefing on university definition 19 July 2024.pdf				Released in full.
46	19 August 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; UAG members	MoE/TEC feedback on draft interim report	Released in part. Information withheld under sections 9(2)(a) and 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
46a	Attachment: MoE TEC Interim report initial feedback.docx				Withhold in full under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
46b	Attachment: [title withheld under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act]				Withhold in full under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.
47	19 August 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; Tim J Fowler	RE: University funding	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
48	30 August 2024	Peter Gluckman	Andy Jackson; Katrina Sutich; Iona Holsted; Tim Fowler; Deirdre Marshall	Thank you to MoE and TEC secretariat members from the UAG panel	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
49	1 September 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; UAG members	RE: UAG panel meeting agenda and papers	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
49a	Attachment: UAG Auckland University visit notes.docx				Withhold in full. Information withheld under section 9(2)(g)(i) of the Act.
49b	Attachment: University Review Paper Kaupapa Māori Aug 20 LU.docx				Released in full.
50	2 September 2024	Peter Gluckman	James Campbell; UAG members; Hema Sridhar	Re: UAG panel meeting agenda and papers	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a)
50a	Attachment: universities-for-the-future.pdf				Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information is publicly available at: https://ufm.dk/en/publications/2023/files/universities-for-the-future.pdf .
51	6 September 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; UAG members	Phase 2 UAG submissions	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.

52	13 September 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; UAG members	Update on Phase 2 Submissions	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
52a	Attachment: A3 Academic preparedness 230824.pptx				Released in full
52b	Attachment: EAG 2024 – MoE Seminar.pptx				Released in full.
53	18 September 2024	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; UAG members	RE: Update on Phase 2 Submissions	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
53a	Attachment: A3 Academic preparedness 230824.pptx				See Document 52a
54	23 September 2024	Peter Gluckman	Andy Jackson	UAG reporting	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
55	30 September 2024	Peter Gluckman	UAG members	Re: UAG report	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
55a	Attachment: UAG report Final draft nt.docx				Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information will soon be publicly available at https://uag.org.nz/ .
55b	Attachment: UAG report Final draft tc.docx				Refused under section 18(d) of the Act. Information will soon be publicly available at https://uag.org.nz/ .
56	Mon 30/09	James Campbell	Peter Gluckman; hema.sridhar@aukland.ac.nz; Alastair MacCormick	RE: UAG report	Released in part. Information withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act.
56a	Attachment: UAG report Final draft ntc.docx				Withhold in full under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act.